

Chander Parkash Malhotra Vs The State of Punjab and others

Court: High Court Of Punjab And Haryana At Chandigarh

Date of Decision: Sept. 8, 1988

Citation: (1989) 1 ILR (P&H) 314

Hon'ble Judges: S.S. Sodhi, J

Bench: Single Bench

Advocate: S.C. Sibal, for the Appellant; D.N. Rampal for A.G. Punjab, for the Respondent

Final Decision: Allowed

Judgement

S.S. Sodhi, J.

Chander Prakash Malhotra, the petitioner here filed the present petition as far back as October 1982 seeking a direction that he be granted admission to the Medical College, Patiala.

2. There is a competitive entrance examination prescribed by the State of Punjab for selection of candidates for admission to the Medical Colleges

owned and run by it with a reservation of seats prescribed therein for sportsmen and sports-women to the extent of 2 per cent, for admission to

these Colleges. For the relevant year, seven seats were reserved under this sports category. It is against one of these seats that the petitioner

sought admission.

3. The rules relating to the admission to candidates to the Medical Colleges were as set out in the notification issued by the Punjab Government on

May 18, 1982. The relevant part thereof as incorporated in the prospectus for admission to the Medical Colleges is reproduced hereunder:-

3.2(a)-Admission shall be given on the basis of the relative merit of candidates determined on the result of the competitive entrance examination. In

the case of reserved seats relative merit of the candidates shall be determined within each category of reservation. A candidate, however, must

secure a minimum of 50 per cent marks in the competitive entrance examination to qualify for admission Candidates belonging to Scheduled

Castes/Scheduled Tribes will have to secure a minimum of 33% marks in the said examination to qualify for admission Within each reserved

category the criterion for determining relative merit shall be the performance in the competitive entrance examination alone. In any main reserved

category, there will be no sub category for preference. For example, in sports category, merit of candidates having different sports grades will be

determined only on the basis of performance in the entrance examination. Similarly, there will be no preferential sub category in the reserved

categories mentioned as (vii), (viii), (ix) in para-III.

(b) Seats left vacant in the reserved categories may be filled from the candidates of general category.

(c) Seats are reserved to the categories noted below and to the extent mentioned against each:-

(i) Scheduled castes/Scheduled Tribes, 25%

(ii) Backward Classes 5%

(iii) Backward Area 2%

(iv) Border Area 2%

(v) Sportsmen/women 2%

(vi) Nominees of the Central/State Govt. 7%

(vii) Children/grand children of Political 2%

Sufferers.

(viii) Children/grand children of defence 2%

personnel

(ix) Handicapped candidates (for MBBS course) 1%

only

Note.-4-A candidate shall be eligible for admission under category (v) above only if he/she produces a certificate from the Director, Sports

Department, Punjab, Chandigarh.

4. The petitioner sought admission under the sports category by virtue of his participation at the National Level in Volleyball. In the Pre Entrance

Medical Test for admission held in June 1982, he obtained more than 50 per cent marks and thereby fulfilled the essential condition for eligibility for

admission.

5. As mentioned earlier, seven seats had been reserved for sportsmen. The name of the petitioner figured in the third place for these seven seats

reserved under the sports category, but he was virtually at the top as the first and second candidates in this list had secured admission under the

general category.

6. On July 19, 1982, the Punjab Government, however, issued another notification whereby the qualifying marks for sportsmen in the pre-

entrance test for admission to Medical Colleges was reduced from 50 to 25 per cent. This adversely affected the position of the petitioner as

admissions were given thereafter not only on the basis of result of the pre entrance examination, but also on the gradation of candidates made by

the department of sports. It was, faced with this situation, that the petitioner rushed to this Court seeking to challenge the notification reducing the

qualifying marks in the pre-entrance test for sportsmen for admission to the Medical Colleges.

7. It was the contention of Mr. S.C. Sibal, counsel for the petitioner that selection of candidates under the sports category on the basis of their

gradation in the field of sports, was wholly untenable and could not be sustained in law. Reference was here made to the judgment of the Division

Bench in CWP 3059 of 1982, *Miss. Vandana Rawal v. State of Punjab and others* C.W.P. 3059 of 1982 decided on August 4, 1984, where the

prescription of minimum qualifying marks for sportsmen in the pre entrance examination for admission to Medical Colleges was challenged. It was

held, there that the prescription of minimum qualifying marks in this examination was patently valid both on principle and precedent as the object

was to train and qualify candidates to become doctors and not sportsmen and sportswomen and the criteria for admission to Medical Colleges

was thus rightly laid down by the government to be the performance of candidates in the competitive entrance examination as provided in the

prospectus.

8. Seen in this light, there can be no escape from the conclusion that the respective merit of the candidates for admission to Medical Colleges even

under the sports category has to be assessed on the basis of their performance in the pre-entrance examination and not with reference to any

gradation by the department of sports, on the basis of proficiency in the field of sports.

9. As regards the petitioner, it deserves note that this Court by its order of November 2, 1982 granted him provisional admission to the Medical

College. The petitioner has since passed his M.B.B.S. Examination and has also completed his internship.

10. Further, on June 1, 1988, the petitioner moved civil miscellaneous application 7584 of 1988, whereby he prayed that the respondent

University be directed to declare the marks obtained by the petitioner in the M.B.B.S. Examination to enable him to get admission for a House job.

In dealing with this application, A.L. Bahri, J. on June 10, 1988, directed the respondent-University to send copies of the marks-sheet of the

petitioner to the Medical Superintendent, Rajindra Hospital, Patala and the Director, Health Services, Union Territory, Chandigarh, to enable the

petitioner to get a House job, if found otherwise eligible.

11. Such thus being the situation in the present case, there can be no escape from the conclusion that the petitioner was indeed entitled to

admission as claimed. The relief originally sought in this behalf has, however, since been over taken by subsequent events, namely; the fact that he

has since passed his M.B.B.S. Examination and also has completed his internship. A direction is accordingly now issued to the Punjabi University,

Patiala to forthwith release and declare the final result of the petitioner for the M.B.B.S. Examination.

12. This petition is thus hereby accepted with costs. Counsel fee Rs. 500/-.